Coherent Exciton Dynamics in Supramolecular Light-Harvesting Nanotubes Revealed by Ultrafast Quantum Process Tomography

Joel Yuen-Zhou,† Dylan H. Arias,‡ Dorthe M. Eisele,† Colby P. Steiner,† Jacob J. Krich,§ Mounig Bawendi,† Keith A. Nelson,† and Alán Aspuru-Guzik†,*

†Center for Excitonics, Research Laboratory of Electronics, Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Cambridge, Massachusetts, United States, ‡Department of Chemistry, Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Cambridge, Massachusetts, United States, §Department of Physics, University of Ottawa, Ottawa, ON, Canada, and †Department of Chemistry and Chemical Biology, Harvard University, Cambridge, Massachusetts, United States

ABSTRACT Long-lived exciton coherences have been recently observed in photosynthetic complexes via ultrafast spectroscopy, opening exciting possibilities for the study and design of coherent exciton transport. Yet, ambiguity in the spectroscopic signals has led to arguments against interpreting them in terms of exciton dynamics, demanding more stringent tests. We propose a novel strategy, quantum process tomography (QPT), for ultrafast spectroscopy and apply it to reconstruct the evolving quantum state of excitons in double-walled supramolecular light-harvesting nanotubes at room temperature from eight narrowband transient grating experiments. Our analysis reveals the absence of nonsecular processes, unidirectional energy transfer from the outer to the inner wall exciton states, and coherence between those states lasting about 150 fs, indicating weak electronic coupling between the walls. Our work constitutes the first experimental QPT in a “warm” and complex system and provides an elegant scheme to maximize information from ultrafast spectroscopy experiments.

KEYWORDS: quantum process tomography · supramolecular aggregates · energy transfer · exciton coherence · ultrafast spectroscopy · open quantum system · nonlinear optics

Recently, there has been great excitement about the detection of long-lived coherent dynamics in natural light-harvesting photosynthetic complexes via two-dimensional spectroscopy.1–3 This long-lived coherence has generated interest and debate about its role in the efficient design of light harvesters and exciton transport in biological and artificial settings.4−7 These discussions have highlighted the importance of correctly interpreting the spectroscopic signals in terms of the microscopic dynamics in the material. The interplay between excitonic dynamics and vibrational dynamics can produce complex and potentially ambiguous spectroscopic signals, which can make extraction of information about exciton transport challenging.8−10 Therefore, it is essential to develop methods to reliably extract the quantum dynamics of the interrogated material.11,12 In this article, we demonstrate the complete and systematic characterization of room-temperature quantum dynamics of a condensed phase model molecular system with a well-understood absorption spectrum13,14 via ultrafast quantum process tomography (QPT);15−18 we fully determine the dynamics of the excitons originating from the inner and outer walls of supramolecular light-harvesting nanotubes (Figure 1a). This article is organized as follows: First, we briefly sketch the QPT formalism as a general method to maximize information from a quantum system interacting with its environment. Then, we describe the optical setup and the nanotubes and explain how these two are suited for the QPT protocol. Finally, we present the experimental data and its analysis, yielding a full characterization of the quantum dynamics of the excitonic system. To our knowledge, this article constitutes the first experimental realization of QPT on a molecular system in condensed phase and provides general guidelines to adapt standard spectroscopic experiments to carry out QPT.

The time evolution of the excited state of an open quantum system (a system

* Address correspondence to aspuru@chemistry.harvard.edu.

Received for review November 26, 2013 and accepted April 11, 2014.

Published online 10.1021/nn406107q

© XXXX American Chemical Society
interacting with its environment, e.g., an electronic system interacting with an environment of vibrations) that is prepared by a pump pulse is, under general assumptions, given by

\[ F(T) = \chi(T) F(0) \]

where \( F(T) \) is the density matrix of the system at time \( T \) after the pump pulse, and the process matrix \( \chi(T) \) is a propagator that relates input and output states. By introducing a basis, eq 1 reads

\[ \rho(T) = \chi(T) \rho(0) \]

(1)

where \( \rho(T) \) is the density matrix of the system at time \( T \) after the pump pulse, and the process matrix \( \chi(T) \) is a propagator that relates input and output states. By introducing a basis, eq 1 reads

The reconstruction of \( \chi(T) \) is the central goal of QPT, an essential step in the verification of quantum technologies and dynamical models. Determining \( \chi(T) \) ensures that we have extracted the maximal amount of information possible about the excited-state dynamics. Previous theoretical work showed that selectively preparing and measuring a number of linearly independent initial states via laser excitation suffices to accomplish QPT. Hence, QPT can in principle be realized with the tools of ultrafast spectroscopy by collecting a sufficient number of signals with varying frequency, polarization, and time delays.

**RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

We study the exciton states of light-harvesting nanotubes (Figure 1a and Methods) that self-assemble in a water/methanol solution from the amphiphilic cyanine dye monomer 3,3'-bis(2-sulfopropyl)-5,5',6,6'-tetrachloro-1,1'-dioctylbenzimidacarbocyanine (abbreviated as C8S3) at room temperature (298 K). The nanotubes are 13 ± 1 nm in diameter and several micrometers long and have a remarkably uniform supramolecular structure; they are composed of...
Figure 2. The concepts behind our QPT protocol. (a) Absorption spectrum of the light-harvesting nanotubes in the flow cell revealing only two optical transitions when exposed to light that is polarized along the long axes of the nanotubes. Each of the three pulses in each TG experiment is narrowband enough that it is selective toward the $|g\rangle\rightarrow|f\rangle$, $|f\rangle\rightarrow|O\rangle$, $|O\rangle\rightarrow|O\rangle$, and $|O\rangle\rightarrow|O\rangle$ transitions, respectively. (b) Energy level diagram of the system. Transitions are allowed between the ground-state manifold (GSM) and any state in the singly excited manifold (SEM) or between any state in the SEM and any in the doubly excited manifold (DEM). (c) Double-sided Feynman diagram representing the general idea of the QPT protocol using TG experiments. The first two pulses prepare the initial state, and the last two pulses detect the final state at the end of the waiting time $T$.

Two concentric cylinders—an inner wall cylinder and an outer wall cylinder—separated by approximately 4 nm.\textsuperscript{35,36}

Upon self-assembly, the broad absorption band of the monomer (Figure 1b) undergoes a large red-shift of $\approx 2500$ cm$^{-1}$, reflecting the strong coupling of the molecules to form delocalized excitonic eigenstates.\textsuperscript{37} In addition, a complex pattern of absorption bands occurs, caused by the nanotube's cylindrical geometry.\textsuperscript{38,39} The two lowest energy bands correspond to transitions between the ground-state manifold (GSM) consisting of electronic state $|g\rangle$ and the singly excited manifold (SEM) consisting of electronic states $|f\rangle$ and $|O\rangle$, primarily originating from the inner wall and the outer wall cylinders, respectively.\textsuperscript{14} These transitions occur at $\omega_{g} \approx 16,600$ cm$^{-1}$ and $\omega_{2g} \approx 17,100$ cm$^{-1}$ ($\omega_{i} = \omega_{i} - \omega_{j}$ denotes a difference in energies) and are polarized primarily parallel to the cylindrical axis of the nanotubes, while the neighboring bands are mostly polarized in the equatorial plane. Flowing the nanotubes through a cell aligns their long axes with the direction of flow. Therefore, polarized light parallel to the cell can be used to isolate the transitions to $|f\rangle$ and $|O\rangle$, yielding the simplified absorption spectrum in Figure 2a. While the absorption spectrum of the nanotubes is well studied,\textsuperscript{14} their excited-state dynamics are not fully understood. Therefore, they are an ideal candidate for ultrafast QPT on a condensed phase molecular system.

The well-separated peaks of $|f\rangle$ and $|O\rangle$ (Figure 1b) suggest a QPT scheme where selectivity is achievable by varying the carrier frequencies of the pulses and fixing their polarizations to be along the long axes of the nanotubes. In particular, we work within a transient grating (TG) setup, where three noncollinear narrowband beams with wavevectors $k_1$, $k_2$, and $k_3$ interact with the nanotubes. Beams 1 and 2 interact simultaneously ($\tau_1 = \tau_2$ where $\tau$ denotes the arrival time of each pulse) with the nanotubes, creating a spatial grating from which beam 3 is diffracted, generating a coherent signal with $k_4 = -k_1 + k_2 + k_3$ that is detected using a fourth broadband reference pulse at $k_4 = k_4$, \textit{via} spectral interferometry.\textsuperscript{40} This generates a complex (absorptive and dispersive) spectrum as a function of waiting time $T = t_3 - t_2$ (see Methods). The first three narrowband pulses are chosen from a toolbox of two different pulse shapes, namely, a pulse that exclusively excites $|f\rangle$ and another one that excites $|O\rangle$, which we shall label as $I$ and $O$, respectively. We then have eight different experiments associated with the triads of carrier frequencies: $OOO$, $OOI$, $II$, $IOI$, $III$, $OII$, $IOI$, and $IOO$. Figure 2a shows the spectra of the pulses on top of a magnified version of the absorption spectrum of the material from Figure 1b.

We are interested in probing the dynamics of the SEM with these optical experiments. In the TG experiment, the first two pulses prepare an initial SEM state.\textsuperscript{17} This state evolves during the waiting time $T$, after which the third pulse probes the state by inducing stimulated emission (SE) to the GSM or excited state absorption (ESA) to the doubly excited manifold (DEM). The DEM consists of three electronic states with two excitons each: $|fO\rangle$, $|fO\rangle$, and $|OO\rangle$, whose energies we assign as being the sums of the corresponding single-exciton states, with no binding energies, this being a reasonable assumption for molecular excitons (see Supporting Information, Sec. 2). We also detect the reduced absorption of the third pulse from the ground state $|g\rangle$ (due to the population moved to the SEM), known as ground-state bleach (GSB). Finally, the decay of this bleach is ground-state recovery (GSR), which contributes as the population in the SEM decays back to the GSM.

Figure 2b shows the energy level diagram for our system, as determined self-consistently from the TG spectra (see Supporting Information, Sec. 2). We implement our QPT scheme, illustrated in Figures 2c and 3, using the narrowband pulses 1 and 0 to selectively
 prepure and detect populations or coherences in the SEM. Figure 3 exhaustively enumerates the possible initial states prepared by pulses 1 and 2 and the possible final states detected by pulses 3 and 4; together, these determine the elements of \( \chi(T) \) that are measured at the indicated emission frequencies in the TG spectra. The emission frequencies are associated with the final elements in each Feynman diagram. For instance, let us consider the experiment \( \mathrm{OIO} \).

Pulses 1 and 2 selectively prepare and detect populations or coherences in the SEM. For instance, let us consider the experiment \( \mathrm{OIO} \). Narrowband pulse 3 and broadband reference pulse 4 detect these transfers by producing a frequency-resolved TG spectrum. The signals at each emission frequency give information on the state of the system at the end of the waiting time \( T \).

Figure 3. QPT protocol for the two-band exciton system of the double-walled nanotube. In the TG setup, the carrier frequencies of the first two narrowband pulses (bottom) selectively determine the possible initial states. Due to interactions with the vibrational surroundings (the bath), the initial state of the excitons can potentially transfer into other states of the SEM during the waiting time \( T \). Narrowband pulse 3 and broadband reference pulse 4 detect these transfers by producing a frequency-resolved TG spectrum. The signals at each emission frequency give information on the state of the system at the end of the waiting time \( T \).

The below analysis indicates that the coherent dynamics are complete by 500 fs (see Figure 5). Both absorptive and dispersive (in our phase convention, real and imaginary, respectively) parts of the complex-valued spectra are collected, but we show only the real part. Whereas Figure 3 predicts that three peaks in the frequency domain are possible in each of the spectra, we find that there is only one peak of significant amplitude in each spectrum, revealing that nonsecular processes such as coherence to population transfers are negligible or too small to be detected with the current experimental setup. Yet, as noted in the previous paragraph as well as in refs 9 and 16–18 and Supporting Information, Sec. 1, some of the peaks report on more than one element of \( \chi(T) \), and a more careful procedure to dissect their contributions is necessary. In fact, each peak amplitude can be expressed as a linear combination of elements of \( \chi(T) \) where the coefficients are products of transition dipole moments. We extract the required information about the dipoles self-consistently from the TG data via the initial condition that at \( T = 0 \) no transfer processes have occurred (see Supporting Information, Sec. 2). The information associated with \( \chi(T) \) is then obtained by integrating the area under the complex-valued peaks and carrying out a constrained linear inversion procedure. This procedure is a semidefinite programming routine that ensures that the extracted \( \chi(T) \) maps physical density matrices as inputs (Hermitian, trace preserving, and positive) to physical density matrices as outputs (Supporting Information, Sec. 3). We use the noise in each experiment at \( T = 0 \) at frequencies away from the strong emission frequencies to characterize the experimental uncertainties in the extracted dipoles; such uncertainties can be...
reduced by increasing the signal-to-noise ratio. We use a Monte Carlo method to propagate these dipole uncertainties to uncertainties in the extracted fit parameters (Supporting Information, Sec. 3). The result of this numerical procedure is in Figure 5. Table 1 summarizes the values of the elements of $\chi(T)$ together with their time scales given by fits with 95% confidence intervals for the statistical error of the fit (first uncertainty) and for the propagated uncertainty in the dipoles (second uncertainty).

The full QPT analysis allows us to characterize all of the electronic processes occurring in the nanotubes’ SEM. This single analysis gives complete information about the population transfer and coherence in the system. The results we find are consistent with previous experiments on similar systems (e.g., for population and coherence times) but also unify them and allow unambiguous determination of energy transfer pathways. Figure 5 shows that, in this system, as anticipated, the nonsecular terms $\chi_{OOOO}(T)$, $\chi_{OIOI}(T)$, $\chi_{IOIO}(T)$, and $\chi_{OOII}(T)$ are negligible throughout the first 500 fs, indicating weak coupling between populations and coherences, as opposed to the situation of the Fenna–Matthews–Olson complex; other analyses assume this result, but the QPT demonstrates it. On the other hand, $\chi_{OOIO}(T)$ and $\chi_{IIIO}(T)$ indicate that population from the higher energy $|O\rangle$ state transfers into $|I\rangle$ within 300 fs. Uphill transfer $|I\rangle \rightarrow |O\rangle$ is not observed, $\chi_{OIOO}(T) \approx 0$ throughout the experiment, while the population term $\chi_{IIII}(T) \approx 1$ remains for all the times of interest. This analysis is distinctly different from other nonlinear spectroscopies, where the amount of collected information is insufficient to unambiguously separate uphill from downhill energy transfer pathways. We also explicitly track decay out of the SEM to the ground state $g$, $\chi_{gqqq}(T)$, and find all such decays to be negligible within the experiment, consistent with the reported time scales of radiative decay for supramolecular aggregates (on the order of tens to hundreds of picoseconds); we can further conclude that there are no faster nonradiative pathways within the probed time scale. Similar conclusions were
observed in pump–probe\(^{45}\) and two-dimensional spectra on a similar nanotubular system.\(^{46}\) Finally, we detect an electronic coherence between \(|O\rangle\) and \(|I\rangle\) that decoheres after about 150 fs, allowing for a few quantum beats corresponding to \(\omega_{CI} = 476 \text{ cm}^{-1}\) to appear. This beating indicates that the electronic coupling between the excitons in the two walls is on the same order as the coupling between these excitons and their respective vibrational baths. This type of electronic coupling was suggested in a similar nanotubular system in the form of weak cross-peaks of the two-dimensional spectra, although quantum beats were not reported.\(^{46}\) Such a weak coupling is consistent with previous redox chemistry experiments on this system.\(^{14}\) The decoherence time scale is similar to reported values on a nanotube system with different chemical composition.\(^{10,47–49}\) As shown in Table 1, the kinetics of the different processes in this system are characterized by stretched exponentials with indices \(\beta\) ranging between 2.6 and 3.3. We speculate that this is due to actual exponential kinetics embedded in Gaussian disorder, but more studies are needed to confirm this idea.

### SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

We have demonstrated for the first time the realizability of QPT on a molecular system in condensed phase, namely, the inner and outer wall excitons of a supra-molecular light-harvesting nanotube. QPT has been obtained through the collection of a series of frequency-resolved TG spectra by systematically varying the frequency components of the pulses. Via numerical inversion of these signals, we have reconstructed the full process matrix \(\chi(T)\) for the single-exciton dynamics. We summarize the main qualitative findings derived from the analysis of \(\chi(T)\). First, an electronic coherence between the inner and outer wall excitons persists for more than a hundred femtoseconds, indicating a weak electronic coupling between the excitons originating from different walls. Second, population transfers unidirectionally from the outer to the inner wall exciton within the first hundreds of femtoseconds, consistent with previous work on similar systems.\(^ {45,46}\) These transfers deviate from simple exponential kinetics, although this may be an effect of the ensemble measurements. Third, nonsecular relaxation dynamics are measured to be negligible, suggesting that the vibrational bath is dense and Markovian. These conclusions are difficult to assess using a standard broadband approach, where these processes are nontrivially convolved in a few peaks.\(^ {16–18}\) Instead, our QPT protocol directly isolates each of these contributions in a systematic way.

As we have shown, QPT can be carried out by a straightforward adaptation of the traditional spectroscopic experiment to ensure that the maximum amount of extractable information, at the quantum mechanical level, is obtained. QPT can be interpreted as a procedure that reconstructs the time-dependent quantum state of a system and, therefore, offers a systematic and transparent way to design ultrafast spectroscopy experiments. It complements the traditional approach where only specific projections of the response of the material are collected and expands upon previous works, which can be regarded as partial QPT experiments.\(^ {11,12}\) The present article reports QPT on a model system with a well-understood absorption spectrum\(^ {14}\) and, therefore, constitutes a good demonstration of the protocol for a SEM of dimension \(d = 2\). For arbitrary dimensions, QPT requires on the order of \(d^d\) data points per time \(T\) (see refs 17 and 18, SI-XII), which translates to about \(d^3\) frequency-resolved TG spectra. If the collection of this amount of experimental data becomes formidable, it will be worth considering stochastic and compressed-sensing methods\(^ {52,53}\) or, alternatively, partial QPT protocols to pinpoint specific mechanisms that do not require the knowledge of an entire process matrix \(\chi(T)\).

For future studies, we envision many opportunities where the QPT paradigm will be powerful in more complex materials. Specific examples include experiments on excitonic networks embedded in complex environments in biological\(^ {45}\) and solid-state systems,\(^ {50}\) or reactive molecular systems with strong vibronic
features,33 where one expects an interesting interplay between electronic coherences and populations beyond secular dynamics and where the detailed imaging of the quantum dynamics is required in order to construct theoretical models. We foresee exciting opportunities in which the QPT approach to ultrafast spectroscopy will provide new insights into the excited-state dynamics of chemical systems.

METHODS

Synthesis of Supramolecular Light-Harvesting Nanotubes in Solution. The amphiphilic cyanine dye derivative 3,3’-bis(2-sulfopropyl)-5,5’,6,6’-tetracloro-1,1’-diocetylbenzimidacarbocyanine (MW = 902.8 g mol⁻¹, Figure 1) was obtained as a sodium salt (FEW Chemicals) and used as received. The individual supramolecular light-harvesting nanotubes, consisting of concentric walls of excitons, were prepared in water/methanol as described in ref 13. Solutions of nanotubes were stored in the dark and used for experiments within 4 h. Absorption spectroscopy was used as a tool to monitor the aggregation process before and during the nonlinear spectroscopy experiments. We limited our investigation to samples that contained the expected spectral contributions from individual double-walled supramolecular light-harvesting nanotubes.1,2

Optical Methods. A noncollinear parametric amplifier54 (NOPA) is pumped by a regeneratively amplified Ti:sapphire laser at 800 nm with a pulse energy of 350 μJ at a repetition rate of 10 kHz. The NOPA produces pulses with a central frequency of 16 800 cm⁻¹, full-width at half-maximum of 700 cm⁻¹, and approximately equal intensities at 16 600 and 17 100 cm⁻¹, i.e., the energies of the |0⟩ and |0⟩ states. The pulses are compressed with a prism pair to approximately 20–25 fs.

After the NOPA, the beam passes through a 2D phase mask optimized for first-order diffraction to produce four beams in the BOXCARS geometry. The beams then enter a diffraction-based pulse shaper using a Hamamatsu X7550 2D spatial light modulator (SLM) for phase and amplitude shaping of the frequency components of each beam.40 The beams are spatially dispersed by a grating and imaged at different vertical positions by a cylindrical lens onto the SLM for independent temporal shaping. We apply a sawtooth grating pattern in the material due to the change in the third narrowband pulse after a time delay. The third pulse, which acts as a (broadband) local oscillator for heterodyne detection, Spectral interferometry is used to retrieve both the real and imaginary parts of the signal. Between the collection of each of the eight TG spectra, a linear absorption measurement is obtained to ensure that the sample has not degraded.

REFERENCES AND NOTES


